

# Critical Report

## Sonata in G major Wq 85

### Sources

- A** Vienna, Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, XI 36262 (from the collection of Johannes Brahms, 1833–1897). Set of two parts in the hand of Michel, Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's main copyist in Hamburg. Title page (in the hand of Bach): *N 17. | Sonata | a | Flauto: | e | Cembalo | di | C.P.E. Bach.* In a later hand is added *ex G#.* next to the word *Sonata*. Cembalo (title and 6 pages), flute (title *Flauto.* and 3 pages)
- a** Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz, *Mus. ms. Bach P 357*, pp. 55–62. From the collection of Georg Poelchau, 1773–1836. Holograph score (8 pages), written around 1755, with later corrections and revisions in Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's hand. Caption title: *Sonata a 2. Violini e Basso.* The Number *No. 17* is added in the left corner. A note in Bach's hand gives hints how to adapt the trio sonata for flute, violin and bass ("NB. If the first violin part is to be played by the flute, those notes above which a line is drawn must be played an octave higher", see *Revisions*). The bass part is figured throughout.
- a1** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 27898 (from the collection of Guido Richard Wagener, 1824–1896). Wrapper, in the hand of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (containing originally the sources **A**, **a**, and **a1**): *No. 17. | (17.) | Sonata | a | 2 Violini [Bach added later: (oder 1 Flöte u. 1 Violin)] | e | Basso | di | C.P.E. Bach. | G. dur. | ist 2mahl da. | Mit der Partitur.* Set of three parts, version for flute, violin, and bass, written (most likely before about 1780) by Michel, Bach's main copyist in Hamburg. Title page (Basso part): *SONATA. | Flauto Traverso. | Violino, | e | Basso, | | da. C.P.E. Bach. Basso* (title and 3 pages, figured throughout), *Flauto Traverso* (4 pages), *Violino* (4 pages). Bach added *No. 17.* on top of the page.
- B** Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 6354 *MSM* (Wq 85): Set of two parts written (ca. 1788) by Michel; authentic copy for Johann Jakob Heinrich Westphal (1756–1835) in Schwerin. Title: *Sonata | à | Flauto Trav: | e | Cembalo. | da | C.P.E. Bach.* Cembalo (title and 6 pages, bass partly figured), Flute (Title *Flauto Trav:* and 3 pages).
- NB. Despite the entry in the Helm-Catalogue (E. E. Helm, *A Thematic Catalogue of the Works of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach*, New Haven and London, 1989, no. 508), no copy of the work is extant in the Bibliothèque Royale Albert I in Brussels. Most likely, the names of the two Brussels libraries were confused, as the copy of the Conservatoire Royal de Musique is not mentioned by Helm. A modern manuscript in the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde (same shelf number as source **A**) was not consulted.

### Evaluations of sources

The holograph **a** is the oldest surviving source. The other copies show only minor divergences, mostly omitted or displaced ornaments and slurs. Sources **a1** and **A** are copied independently of each other from an intermediary source (most likely a set of parts dating from Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's Berlin years). That they were not copied directly from the holograph **a** can be seen from a small number of instances where both copies have the same correct reading although the holograph is in error (see *Readings*, *Allegretto*, m. 9, and *Andantino*, m. 66). Michel's slurring is however notoriously imprecise and +-signs are generally replaced by *tr*-signs (thus possibly ignoring a distinction between short and long trills). The keyboard part of **A** is a literal adaption of the violin and basso parts of the trio sonata version, bass figures remain only where the right hand pauses. The variant readings of **B** come very close to **A** although one error (*Andantino*, m. 71) makes it rather unlikely that **B** is directly copied from **A**. Therefore, holograph **a** is our main source; **A** and **a1** served for comparisons. Bass figures are, however, only given where **A** has them. Source **a1** includes a number of slurs not found in the other sources, possibly in Bach's hand. These have been entered in parentheses into the present edition. All indications in parentheses are from **a1**, if not otherwise stated in the list of readings. All editorial suggestions are given in square brackets. As the sources **A**, **a** and **a1** provide a definite and unproblematic text, the numerous extant copies of the trio sonata versions Wq 152/157 have not been collated.

#### Corrections in **a**:

Original readings are given where legible.

#### *Allegretto*

1	fl.	Originally, only the 2nd and 3rd notes were slurred.
11	r.h.	Originally, only the 2nd and 3rd notes were slurred.
14	fl., l.h.	Slurs probably added later.
30	r.h.	Originally two 8th notes <i>c#</i> <sup>7</sup> instead of quarter note?
105	fl.	Erroneously two 8th notes <i>e</i> plus a quarter note.
116	l.h.	1st note was 8th note.

#### *Andantino*

49f.	fl., r.h.	The appoggiaturas were not written out originally.
52f.	all	A measure is crossed out between mm. 52 and 53.
79	fl.	
97	l.h.	1st note.

<i>Allegro</i>		
24	fl.	1st note was quarter note originally.
36–39	fl.	
42		
118	l.h.	2nd note was an octave lower (cf. m. 116).

#### Revisions in a:

Original readings are given where legible.

*All'ottava* indications in the 1st violin / flute part of source a by means of a line over the notes (see *Sources*).

#### *Allegretto*

85 – 1st half of m. 88  
125–129

#### *Andantino*

62–69 See *Readings*.

#### *Allegro*

41–44 and 60–62 (*piano* passages only)  
111 (with upbeat) – 118 (1st note)  
131 (with upbeat) – 136

#### Readings

Lacking or misplaced slurs or figures in **a1**, **A** and **B** are reported only when they help to establish the interrelationship of the sources. In **a1** several appoggiaturas do not have the correct note values.

#### *Allegretto*

9	fig.	<b>a</b> : <b>6</b> over 3rd note is lacking.
14	fig.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : unnecessary <b>6</b> over <i>f</i> #.
38	fig.	<b>a1</b> : figures misplaced (over 1st and 3rd 8th notes). <b>A</b> , <b>a</b> , <b>B</b> : 1st figure misplaced (over 1st note).
57	fl.	All: slur over last two notes only.
58	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has no flag.
76f.		All: slurs are broken into two parts ( <b>A</b> is changing systems after m. 76).

#### *Andantino*

20	keyb.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : <i>f</i> are lacking.
22	fig.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : 1st note has unnecessary bass figure <b>6</b> .
58	fl.	All: <i>b</i> <sup>7</sup> is notated as two tied 8th notes.
62–69	fl.	<b>a</b> : <i>all'ottava</i> not until m. 66 where a new system begins.
71	l.h.	<b>B</b> : unnecessary indication <i>tasto</i> over 2nd note.
80	r.h.	<b>A</b> : dot after last note.
106	fl.	<b>a1</b> : <i>f</i> is lacking.

#### *Allegro*

Heading		<b>a</b> : <i>gr</i> added to <i>Allegro</i> by Bach? [= <i>Allegro grazioso</i> ?].
8	r.h.	<b>a1</b> : <i>f</i> is lacking?
30	fig.	<b>B</b> : bass figure is lacking.
42	fl.	<b>a1</b> : last two notes beamed separately.
48, 54	r.h.	<b>B</b> : appoggiaturas tied to main notes.
48, 130	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>a1</b> , <b>B</b> : <i>p</i> are lacking.
50	r.h.	<b>A</b> : # is lacking.
	l.h.	<b>A</b> : has slur.
51	r.h.	<b>B</b> : <i>f</i> is lacking.
53	r.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : strokes instead of dots.
68	fig.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : bass figure is lacking.
79	fig.	<b>a</b> : # over 1st note.
84	r.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : slur over last four notes.
89	fl.	<b>B</b> : dot over 1st note.
94	fl.	<b>A</b> : 2nd note with stroke?
128	fig.	<b>A</b> , <b>a1</b> , <b>B</b> : strokes are lacking.
135	fig.	<b>a1</b> : strokes are lacking.
	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : slur is lacking.

#### Sonata in G major Wq 86

#### Sources

- A** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 27895; from the composer's musical library, later in the collection of Guido Richard Wagener (1824–1896). Keyboard part only (title and 6 pages), in the hand of Michel, Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's main copyist in Hamburg. Title (mainly in the hand of Bach, ca. 1787): *Sonata | a | Flauto | e | Cembalo | di | C.P.E. Bach. | (22) | No. 22*. The left hand is figured only where the right hand has longer rests. Most likely a separate flute part once belonging to **A** is lost (see *Evaluation of Sources*).
- a** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 27895. From the collection of G. R. Wagener (see source **A**), presumably also part of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's library. Trio sonata version (Wq 153 / H 586); set of three parts (ca. 1760?) in the hand of an unknown (Berlin) copyist. All parts (*Flauto Traverso*, *Violino*, *Basso*) have four pages and bear no author's name.
- B** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 6354 MSM (Wq 86): Set of two parts written (ca. 1788) by Michel, authentic copy for Johann Jakob Heinrich Westphal (1756–1825) in Schwerin. *Cembalo* (title and 6 pages), *Flauto* (4 pages) Title page: *Sonata | a | Flauto. | è | Cembalo. | | di. C.P.E. Bach.*
- C** Berlin, Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz, *Mus. ms. Bach St 574*. Set of two parts in the hand of Michel (ca. 1780?). Title: *Sonata | a | Flauto | e | Cembalo | da. C.P.E. Bach.* *Cembalo* (title and 6 pages),

Flauto (4 pages). Once in the possession of Johann Heinrich Grave (ca. 1760 – after 1810), lawyer in Greifswald, who signed the cembalo part.

### Evaluation of sources

Although the differences between the sources are relatively insignificant, the interrelationship of the extant sources is complex and cannot be established with certainty. Source **a** seems to be an early authentic copy of the lost holograph of the trio sonata version and belonged most likely to Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's personal library. The readings of **A** (definitely stemming from Bach's estate) come very close to **a**, the keyboard part being an adaption of the violin and basso parts of the trio sonata version. The keyboard part of **B** is copied after **A**. It cannot be determined whether or not a separate flute part was written out for source **A**. Since sources **A** and **a** were apparently kept together, the flute part of source **a** could have been used for both versions. The flute part of **B** shows, however, variant readings that cannot possibly have originated directly from the extant flute part of the trio sonata version **a**. Sources **C** and **a** were not copied from each other. Copy **C** is more correct than **A** (and **B**), and it includes some ornaments not found in other sources. It is, however, more likely that Grave was responsible for these ornaments than the composer.

The simplest scenario in order to link the extant sources is the assumption that **a** and **C** were copied at different times from the holograph, **C** being an adaption of the trio sonata for keyboard and flute. Sources **A** and **B** seem to be dependent from **a**, nevertheless we must assume that at least another flute part once existed (see above). Therefore only sources **a** and **C** are relevant in order to establish the musical text.

Source **a** was used as the primary source for the present edition. **A**, **C** and the flute part of **B** were used for comparisons. In accordance with **A**, **B** and **C**, bass figures are given only where the right hand has rests. All additions in parentheses are from source **C**, if not stated otherwise. All editorial suggestions are given in square brackets. The numerous extant copies of the trio sonata version have not been collated.

### Readings

#### Andante

2	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has a flag.
3	fig.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : 1st figure over 2nd note.
4	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has a flag.
7	fl.	<b>a</b> , <b>C</b> : slur from $a^2$ to $f\#^2$ , cf. m. 16, r.h.
9	fl.	<b>C</b> : <i>tr</i> over 4th, not 5th note.
	fig.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : figure over 1st note.
10	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : $f$ is missing.

16	r.h.	<b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : misread tie of appoggiatura as a slur from $f\#^2$ to $g^2$ .
21	r.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : slur over last two notes only.
26	keyb.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : no slurs.
26f.	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : tie is lacking.
27	r.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : last slur is lacking. <b>C</b> : last two slurs are lacking.
33	l.h.	<b>B</b> : last two notes are slurred.
41	r.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : <i>tr</i> is lacking.
43	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has a flag.
45	fl.	All: appoggiatura has a flag.
49	fl.	<b>C</b> : appoggiaturas tied to main note.
51	r.h.	All: $\curvearrowright$ over last note.
	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiaturas tied to main note.

#### Allegretto

3	r.h.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has flag.
4	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : slur over last four notes only.
6	l.h.	<b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : $f$ not until last note.
10	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has flag.
14	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : $f$ not until last note.
22	l.h.	<b>C</b> : $f$ is lacking.
22f.	fl.	<b>B</b> : tie is lacking.
29f.	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : dynamics under 2nd note.
35	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> : $f$ is lacking.
39	r.h.	<b>A</b> : ornament is <i>t</i> instead of <i>tr</i> . <b>B</b> : appoggiatura has a flag.
43	r.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : appoggiatura has a flag.
50	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : all notes are beamed together.
56	l.h.	<b>C</b> : $f$ is lacking.
61	fl.	<b>C</b> : all notes are slurred.
	l.h.	<b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : all notes beamed together.
69	l.h.	<b>C</b> : last two notes beamed separately.
70	fl.	<b>B</b> : no slur.
73	r.h.	<b>C</b> : $f$ is lacking.
74	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>C</b> : 1st note without stroke.
80	fl.	<b>C</b> : appoggiatura has no stem.
83	l.h.	<b>a</b> : $p$ under 2nd note.
101	l.h.	<b>B</b> : $p$ not until 2nd note.
107	l.h.	<b>C</b> : no bass figures over 3rd note.
108	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : no bass figure.
110	r.h.	<b>C</b> : slur is lacking.
111	r.h.	<b>a</b> , <b>C</b> : appoggiatura has flag.
116	l.h.	All: 2nd ending: $\curvearrowright$ over note.

#### Allegro

8	l.h.	<b>C</b> : all notes beamed together.
23	r.h.	<b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : misread tie as a slur over 3rd and 4th notes.
	l.h.	<b>a</b> , <b>C</b> : 2nd note has a stroke.
100–102	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>B</b> , <b>C</b> : no bass figures.
124	l.h.	<b>A</b> , <b>a</b> , <b>B</b> : 2nd note is G.
129	l.h.	All: 2nd ending: $\curvearrowright$ over note.