

# Critical Report

## Sonata in D major Wq 83

### Sources

- A** Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz, *Mus. ms. Bach P 357*, pp. 105–109 (from the collection of Georg Poelchau, 1773–1836). Holograph score, mainly written around ca. 1747. Caption title: *No: 11 | Sonata a 1 Fl. Trav. 1 Violin e Basso. di CPE Bach*. Despite this title, the score contains the version for flute and obbligato keyboard as well (see *Preface*). Some of the revisions (see below) may originate from the last years of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's life when he entered the bass figures. In the autograph, m. 155 of the first movement is missing and the last two measures of this movement are crossed out. The bass part is damaged from m. 142 on. Most likely, Bach added a paste-over containing mm. 155–157 at the bottom of this page. That paste-over is now missing (or at least not visible on the microfilm).
- B** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 6354 MSM (Wq 83): Set of two parts written (ca. 1787) by Michel, Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's main copyist in Hamburg. Title page (in Bach's hand): *Sonata | a | Flauto | e | Cembalo | da | C.P.E.Bach*. Cembalo (2 sheets, p. 1 title page, 6 pages); Flauto (1 sheet, p. 1 title page, 3 pages). Authentic copy for Johann Jacob Heinrich Westphal (1756–1825) in Schwerin.

### Evaluation of sources

**B** is copied after **A** (or after an intermediary copy; see *Readings, Allegro un poco*, m. 103). The few divergences are omissions or simply misreadings as the autograph is sometimes difficult to read. Michel adapted the notation of ornaments to his own practice, e.g. Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's distinction between + and *tr* (short trill vs. long trill?) is ignored. Several slurs are misplaced or too short. The edition is therefore based on Bach's autograph manuscript **A**. As the two sources **A** and **B** provide a definite and unproblematic text, the numerous extant copies of the trio sonata version Wq 151 / H 547 have not been collated.

### Revisions and corrections

Besides the bass figures, **A** was revised by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach in the following places before **B** was copied. The original reading is reported where legible.

#### *Allegro un poco*

Heading: *un poco* added later (?).

19	l.h.	2nd half of m. 19.
21	l.h.	Originally 4 times <i>c#</i> ?
103	fl., r.h.	

#### *Largo*

10	l.h.	Last note corrected from <i>B</i> .
33–35		

#### *Allegro*

57, 190	fl.	1st ending originally with appoggiatura (?), 2nd ending was written out.
57	l.h.	1st ending <i>g–f#</i> reversed, 2nd ending <i>c#–d</i> reversed?
73	fl., r.h.	Parts reversed?
115	fl.	<i>d</i> <sup>2</sup> instead of 16th rest?
147, 149	r.h.	

### Readings

#### *Allegro un poco*

30	fl.	<b>B</b> : slur over last two notes only.
46	l.h.	<b>B</b> : bass figure: <b>5</b> instead of <b>6</b> .
88f.	fl.	<b>B</b> : tie is lacking.
103	l.h.	<b>B</b> : the notes are beamed in pairs. This may be an indicator that <b>B</b> was not copied directly from <b>A</b> but from an intermediary source (original set of parts for the flute/keyboard version?).
142	r.h.	<b>B</b> : stem is lacking.
146	r.h.	<b>B</b> : 4th note <i>e</i> <sup>2</sup> instead of <i>f#</i> <sup>2</sup> .

#### *Largo*

3	fl.	<b>B</b> : notes are beamed two and four.
47, 92	r.h.	<b>B</b> : notes are slurred in pairs.
62	fl., r.h.	<b>A</b> : slur begins over 1st note.
	r.h.	<b>B</b> : dot also under 1st note.
87	r.h.	<b>B</b> : slur is lacking.
93	r.h.	<b>B</b> : 1st slur is lacking.
114	l.h.	<b>B</b> : trill over last note.

#### *Allegro*

4	l.h.	<b>B</b> : <i>#</i> is placed over the note <i>g</i> .
47	l.h.	<b>B</b> : <b>6</b> instead of <b>7</b> over 2nd note.
126	fl.	<b>A</b> : slur over whole measure.
148f.	fl.	<b>B</b> : slur is lacking.
169	fl.	<b>B</b> : appoggiatura has two flags.
175f.	r.h.	<b>B</b> : tie is lacking.
178	fl.	<b>A</b> : appoggiatura has no flag.

## Sonata in E major Wq 84

### Sources

- a** Holograph score, Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz, *Mus. ms. Bach P 357*, pp. 43–53 (from the collection of Georg Poelchau, 1773–1836); 3 sheets numbered in Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's late

hand (title + 11 pages). Paper type I (12 staves) is used for sheets 1 and 2, paper type II (20 staves) for sheet 3. The title page (on the first page of sheet 3) is ruled but empty with the exception of *No. 15* (corrected from 14) in Bach's hand. This sheet, written around ca. 1750, contains on pp. 2–4 the *Adagio di molto* from m. 16 on and the entire last movement. Most of sheets 1 and 2 were written around ca. 1780, but they contain later revisions (for instance, the insertion of inner voices in the l.h.). Caption title (on sheet 1): *Trio* [crossed out: *für 2 Flöten, oder*] *fürs Clavier u. eine Flöte von C.P.E. Bach*. Order of voices in the score from top to bottom: r.h., fl., l.h. (see *Preface*).

- A** Vienna, Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, XI 36267 (from the collection of Johannes Brahms, 1833–1897). Original set of two parts. Wrapper (containing originally at least sources **a** and **A**) written mainly by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach around 1750: (*15.*) | *No. 15.* | *E dur.* | *Sonata* | *a* | *2 Flauti Traversi* | *e* | *Basso* | *di C.P.E. Bach*. Bach entered the key signature and the number in parentheses during the last years of his life. Despite this title, the wrapper contains now only the version for flute and obbligato keyboard. The two parts are written by an anonymous Hamburg copyist. Copies in the hand of this scribe are documented in Berlin (see source **C**) and Ann Arbor, Michigan, (Violin Sonata Wq 76 / H 512). Bach entered revisions, starting in m. 26 of the *Adagio di molto* (see *Revisions*). The keyboard part (3 sheets: title + 10 pages) has its own title page: *Trio* | *fürs* | *Clavier* | *und eine Flöte* | *von C.P.E. Bach*. Flute part: 1 sheet (4 pages).
- B** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 6354 MSM (Wq 84): Set of two parts written (ca. 1788) by Michel, Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's main copyist in Hamburg. Title page *Trio* | *a* | *Flauto Trav.* | *e* | *Cembalo* | *da* | *C.P.E. Bach*. Cembalo part: 3 sheets (title page + 10 pages); *Flauto. Trav.*: 1 sheet (4 pages). Authorised copy for Johann Jacob Heinrich Westphal (1756–1825) in Schwerin.
- b** Brussels, Bibliothèque du Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 6363 MSM (Wq 162): Set of parts written by Johann Jakob Heinrich Westphal in Schwerin (see source **B**). Title (on wrapper): *E dur* | *Trio* | *a* | *Due Flauti* | *e* | *Basso* | *da* | *C.P.E. Bach*. Three parts (*Basso, Flauto Primo, Flauto Secondo*) on 1 sheet each.
- C** Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preußischer Kulturbesitz, *Mus. ms. Bach St 478* (from the collection of Count Otto von Voß-Buch, 1755–1823). Set of parts written by an anonymous Hamburg copyist. This scribe also wrote source **A**. No title and no attribution as the first page of the keyboard part is left blank. In a later hand (19th century), the work was erroneously attributed to Wilhelm Friedemann Bach. Keyboard: 3 sheets (pp. 1 and 12 blank, 10 pages); Flute: 1 sheet (4 pages).
- NB. An additional copy of the sonata (from the collection of Johann Heinrich Grave, ca. 1760 – after 1810) is reported in Strassbourg (Université, Institut de Musicologie), but could

not be examined. It is most likely copied from source **A** and has therefore no own value as a source (see *Evaluation of Sources* and cf. EB 9354, *Sonata for Flute and Obbligato Keyboard* in C major Wq 87, *Sources*, copy D).

## Evaluation of sources

**A** is copied from **a** with only a few mistakes. However, the articulation is carelessly entered, and is missing entirely, for instance, in the last movement, mm. 117–150 (r.h.) and mm. 129–148 (fl.). Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's distinctions between + and *tr* and between stroke and dot are often ignored. Although Bach entered revisions in **A**, he did not correct the copyist's errors. **B** and **C** are copied independently of each other from **A**. **B** even retains the layout of **A**. Source **b** is copied after **B** (see *Readings, Allegro assai*, m. 6). **B**, **b** and **C** have therefore no own value as sources. The edition is based on **a** and the autograph revisions in **A**.

Corrections in **a** by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach:  
The original version is reported where legible.

### *Allegretto*

14, 25, 30	fl.	
30, 95	r.h.	Notehead <i>c#</i> erroneously entered (see fl.).
131	r.h.	Last beat
155	r.h.	Noteheads for inner voice entered (see l.h.)
171	r.h.	
191	l.h.	Notehead ( <i>c#</i> <sup>1</sup> ) over last note entered erroneously? Cf. m. 192.

### *Adagio di molto*

19	l.h.	4th note corrected (formerly <i>e</i> ?).
21	l.h.	2nd last note corrected (formerly <i>d</i> ?).

All voices: Bar line was erroneously inserted in the middle of m. 23, also affecting mm. 24f.

The 2nd half of what is now m. 25 was expanded originally to a whole measure. Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach inserted the correct bar lines later, shortening m. 25 by deleting a long rest and adding instead the fermata signs.

### *Allegro assai*

104	l.h.	Corrected from dotted quarter note.
-----	------	-------------------------------------

Revisions by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach

Source **a**:

Bass figures inserted. Upper voice in l.h. added in the *Allegro* and *Adagio di molto* movements (up to m. 24).

### *Allegro*

82f.	r.h.	Lower voice entered.
204–207	fl.	The <i>piano</i> passage was notated an octave lower ( <i>8va</i> indicated).

Source A:

Upper voice added in the left hand in the *Adagio di molto* (m. 26) and throughout the *Allegro assai*.

The following revisions in the final movement (found in A and taken over in all later copies) are likely to be also in Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's hand:

62 fig.  
77f. r.h. Long trills.

Readings

The left hand is notated in all keyboard parts in the bass clef throughout as it originated as the bass part of the trio sonata version. In the third movement, in a many slurs are too short.

a, A, B, b, C: The numerous lacking or misplaced slurs and ornaments in A (and thereafter in B, b, C) are not listed singly.

*Allegretto*

50 fl. A, B, C: appoggiatura has two flags.  
81 l.h. A, B, C: *c#<sup>1</sup>* added erroneously to last chord.

158 fl. A, B, C: last note has *h* instead of *#*.  
204– 207 fl. A, B, C ignore the indication *8va* from a (see *Revisions*).

*Adagio di molto*

5 l.h. A, B: e added to 5th note.  
C: inner voice omitted in the 2nd half of the measure.  
8 r.h. A: slur misplaced, misinterpreted as an ornament over the 2nd note in B and C.  
10 fl. A, B, C: *tr* over 8th and 10th note instead of 9th note.  
24 r.h. A, B, C: additional slur over 8th to 11th note.

*Allegro assai*

6 fl. B, b: slur split in two.  
108 l.h. A, B: *h* instead of *#* before 1st note, *#* before the 3rd note only; later corrected in C.  
148 l.h. All: short bows over bass figures.