

Critical Report

Source

Brussels, Conservatoire Royal de Musique, 5517 MSM. The manuscript is a bound volume that consists of all but one of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's eleven sonatas for flute and basso continuo in score. The copies may be regarded as authentic as they were formerly in the possession of Johann Jacob Heinrich Westphal (1756–1825) in Schwerin. Westphal ordered copies of almost all of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's works between 1786 and ca. 1800 from the composer himself and after Bach's death in 1788 from his widow and his daughter. Judging from the notational problems found in some of the flute sonatas, it is, however, rather unlikely that these copies originated during the lifetime and under the supervision of the composer.

Each sonata in 5517 MSM is written separately and consists of two folded sheets of paper (watermark: heraldic lily, countermark: IV; a common paper type of Dutch origin). The scribe is known as Anon. 305, a Hamburg copyist active around 1790.

Critical Remarks

Sonata in A minor Wq 128

5517 MSM, pp. 33–40 (p. 33 title, p. 40 blank). Title page: *A. mol. | Sonata, | à | Flauto Traverso Solo | e | Basso | del Sigl' [= Signore] C. Ph. E. Bach.* Heading (p. 34): *Sonata. Flauto Trav: Solo.* Variable number of staves per page in order to avoid page turns within movements.

Andante

- | | | |
|----|------|---|
| 10 | fl. | Measure ends with a quarter and an eighth-note rest. |
| 11 | fl. | $C\sharp^2$ is a dotted quarter note. |
| 14 | fig. | The figure \flat is also placed above 5th note next to the figure \sharp . |
| 15 | fig. | 2nd figure already under 2nd note of flute part. |
| 22 | fl. | \curvearrowright already above 3rd from last note which is a quarter note only. |

Allegro

- | | | |
|----|------|---|
| 20 | fig. | 1st figure not until 2nd note. |
| 35 | fig. | Figures read \sharp and \flat . |
| 40 | fig. | 1st figure is \sharp instead of \flat . |
| 58 | fig. | 1st two figures are \flat instead of \sharp . |
| 59 | fl. | 3rd, 5th and 7th notes are d^2 , c^2 , and b^1 respectively, causing consecutive octaves with the bass. |

- | | | |
|----|------|---|
| 64 | fig. | 2nd figure not until 4th note. |
| 65 | fig. | 1st figures are \sharp . |
| 74 | fig. | Figure \sharp already above 4th note. |
| 76 | fig. | Figure \sharp not until 2nd note. |
| 86 | fig. | Extension lines above 1st and 2nd, not 2nd and 3rd notes. |
| 87 | fig. | Figures above 2nd note are \sharp . |
| 89 | bc. | Last note is c. |
| 92 | fig. | 1st figures not until 2nd note. |
| 99 | fl. | 4th note is $c\sharp^2$. |



Vivace

- | | | |
|----|------|--|
| 19 | fig. | Figure is \flat instead of \sharp . |
| 23 | fig. | 1st figure has \sharp instead of \flat . |
| 52 | fig. | 2nd figure is \sharp . |
| 65 | fig. | 1st figures are \flat ; the \flat being added later? |
| 67 | fig. | 2nd figure already above 2nd note. |

Sonata in G major Wq 134

5517 MSM, pp. 9–16 (p. 9 title, p. 16 blank). Title page: *G. #. | Sonata, | à | Flauto Traverso Solo | e | Basso | del Sigl' [= Signore] C. Ph. E. Bach.* Heading (p. 10): *Sonata. Flauto Trav: Solo.* Variable number of staves per page in order to avoid page turns within movements.

Adagio

- | | | |
|----|------|---|
| 2 | fl. | The 3rd and 4th notes are notated as 32nd notes (triplet). |
| 6 | fig. | 4th to 6th figures slightly displaced. |
| 12 | fl. | Dot is lacking after 2nd note. |
| 19 | fl. | The rhythmic figure  represents probably  |

Allegro

- | | | |
|----|------|--|
| 10 | bc. | Eighth-note rest is lacking. |
| 14 | bc. | The copyist apparently misread a f under the 3rd note as a bass figure \sharp ; the bass figure was then repeated above the note in a later hand (by Westphal?). |
| 19 | fl. | f already under 1st note. |
| 53 | fig. | 1st figure not until 1st note. |
| 54 | fl. | Slur over 3rd to 5th note only. |

Vivace

- | | | |
|----|-----|--|
| 23 | bc. | 2nd note is $f\sharp^1$ instead of d^1 . |
|----|-----|--|